

Guilt in Judaism and Psychoanalysis

EJ By Elie Jesner

בראשית ג'ה'-י"ג

(ה) כִּי יֵדַע אֱלֹהִים כִּי בַיּוֹם אֲכַלְכֶם מִמֶּנּוּ וְנִפְקְחוּ עֵינֵיכֶם וְהֵייתֶם כְּאֱלֹהִים יֹדְעֵי טוֹב וָרָע: (ו) וַתֵּרָא הָאִשָּׁה כִּי טוֹב הָעֵץ לְמֵאֲכָל וְכִי תֹאווֶה-הִיא לְעֵינַיִם וְנִחְמַד הָעֵץ לְהַשְׂכִּיל וַתִּקַּח מִפְּרִיו וַתֹּאכַל וַתִּתֵּן גַּם-לְאִשָּׁה עִמָּה וַיֹּאכְלוּ: (ז) וַתִּפְקְחֶנָּה עֵינֶיהָ וַיֵּדַעוּ כִּי עִרְמָם הֵם וַיִּתְּפוּרוּ עָלֶיהָ תְּאֵנָה וַיַּעֲשׂוּ לָהֶם חֲגָרֹת: (ח) וַיִּשְׁמְעוּ אֶת-קוֹל יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים מְתַהַלְלִים בְּגֵן לְרוּחַ הַיּוֹם וַיִּתְּחַבֵּא הָאָדָם וַאֲשֶׁתּוֹ מִפְּנֵי יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים בְּתוֹךְ עֵץ הַגֵּן: (ט) וַיִּקְרָא יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים אֶל-הָאָדָם וַיֹּאמֶר לוֹ אַיֶּכָּה: (י) וַיֹּאמֶר אֶת-קוֹלִי שָׁמַעְתִּי בְּגֵן וַאֲרָא כִּי-עִירָם אָנֹכִי וְאַחֲבָא: (יא) וַיֹּאמֶר מִי הִגִּיד לְךָ כִּי עִירָם אַתָּה הַמִּן-הָעֵץ אֲשֶׁר צִוִּיתִיךָ לֵבִלְתִּי אֲכַל-מִמֶּנּוּ אַכְלֶת: (יב) וַיֹּאמֶר הָאָדָם הָאִשָּׁה אֲשֶׁר נָתַתָּה עִמָּדִי הִיא נָתְנָה-לִּי מִן-הָעֵץ וַאֲכָלוּ: (יג) וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים לְאִשָּׁה מַה-זֹּאת עָשִׂית וַתֹּאמֶר הָאִשָּׁה הִנְחַשׁ הִשְׂיָאֵנִי וַאֲכָלוּ:

Genesis 3:5-13

(5) but God knows that as soon as you eat of it your eyes will be opened and you will be like divine beings who know good and bad.” (6) When the woman saw that the tree was good for eating and a delight to the eyes, and that the tree was desirable as a source of wisdom, she took of its fruit and ate. She also gave some to her

husband, and he ate. (7) Then the eyes of both of them were opened and they perceived that they were naked; and they sewed together fig leaves and made themselves loincloths. (8) They heard the sound of God יהוה moving about in the garden at the breezy time of day; and the Human and his wife hid from God יהוה among the trees of the garden. (9) God יהוה called out to the Human and said to him, “Where are you?” (10) He replied, “I heard the sound of You in the garden, and I was afraid because I was naked, so I hid.” (11) “Who told you that you were naked? Did you eat of the tree from which I had forbidden you to eat?” (12) The Human said, “The woman You put at my side—she gave me of the tree, and I ate.” (13) And God יהוה said to the woman, “What is this you have done!” The woman replied, “The serpent duped me, and I ate.”

בראשית ד':ה'-ט"ו

(ה) וְאֶל־קַיִן וְאֶל־מַנְחֶהֱתוֹ לֹא שָׁעָה וַיִּחַר לְקַיִן מְאֹד וַיִּפְּלוּ פָּנָיו: (ו)
 וַיֹּאמֶר יְהוָה אֶל־קַיִן לָמָּה חָרָה לָךְ וְלָמָּה נָפְלוּ פָּנֶיךָ: (ז) הֲלוֹא
 אִם־תֵּיטִיב שְׂאֵת וְאִם לֹא תֵיטִיב לִפְתַּח חַטָּאת רֹבֵץ וְאֵלֶיךָ
 תִּשְׁוֹקֶתוּ וְאַתָּה תִּמְשָׁל־בּוֹ: (ח) וַיֹּאמֶר קַיִן אֶל־הֶבֶל אָחִיו וַיְהִי
 בְּהִיּוֹתָם בַּשָּׂדֶה וַיִּקָּם קַיִן אֶל־הֶבֶל אָחִיו וַיַּהַרְגֵהוּ: (ט) וַיֹּאמֶר
 יְהוָה אֶל־קַיִן אֵי הֶבֶל אָחֶיךָ וַיֹּאמֶר לֹא יָדַעְתִּי הֲשֹׁמֵר אָחִי אָנֹכִי:
 (י) וַיֹּאמֶר מַה עָשִׂיתָ קוֹל דְּמֵי אָחֶיךָ צֹעֲקִים אֵלַי מִן־הָאֲדָמָה: (יא)
 וְעַתָּה אַרְוֵר אֹתָהּ מִן־הָאֲדָמָה אֲשֶׁר פָּצְתָה אֶת־פִּיהָ לְקַחַת

אֶת־דְּמֵי אָחִיךָ מִיָּדְךָ: (יב) כִּי תַעֲבֹד אֶת־הָאֲדָמָה לֹא־תִסְרֹף
תִּתְּכֶחָה לָךְ נֶעַ וְנָד תִּהְיֶה בְּאֶרֶץ: (יג) וַיֹּאמֶר קַיִן אֶל־יְהוָה גְּדוֹל
עוֹנֵי מִנְשָׂא: (יד) הֵן גִּרְשָׁתָּ אֹתִי הַיּוֹם מֵעַל פְּנֵי הָאֲדָמָה וּמִפְּנֵיךָ
אֶסָּתֵר וְהָיִיתִי נֶעַ וְנָד בְּאֶרֶץ וְהָיָה כָּל־מִצְאֵי יְהִרְגֵנִי: (טו) וַיֹּאמֶר
לּוֹ יְהוָה לָכֵן כָּל־הַרְג קַיִן שְׁבַע־תַּיִם יִקָּם וַיִּשָּׂם יְהוָה לְקַיִן אֹת
לְבִלְתִּי הַכּוֹת־אֹתוֹ כָּל־מִצְאֹו:

Genesis 4:5-15

(5) but to Cain and his offering [God] paid no heed. Cain was much distressed and his face fell. (6) And יהוה said to Cain,

“Why are you distressed,
And why is your face fallen?”

(7) Surely, if you do right,
There is uplift.

But if you do not do right
Sin couches at the door;

Its urge is toward you,

Yet you can be its master.” (8) Cain said to his brother Abel ... and when they were in the field, Cain set upon his brother Abel and

killed him. (9) יהוה said to Cain, “Where is your brother Abel?”

And he said, “I do not know. Am I my brother’s keeper?” (10)

“What have you done? Hark, your brother’s blood cries out to Me from the ground! (11) Therefore, you shall be more cursed than the

ground, which opened its mouth to receive your brother’s blood from your hand. (12) If you till the soil, it shall no longer yield its

strength to you. You shall become a ceaseless wanderer on earth.”

(13) Cain said to יהוה, “My punishment is too great to bear! (14) Since You have banished me this day from the soil, and I must avoid Your presence and become a restless wanderer on earth— anyone who meets me may kill me!” (15) יהוה said to him, “I promise, if anyone kills Cain, sevenfold vengeance shall be exacted.” And יהוה put a mark on Cain, lest anyone who met him should kill him.

ויקרא ה' י"ז-י"ט

(יז) וְאִם-נִפְשׁוֹ כִּי תִחַטָּא וְעָשְׂתָהּ אַחַת מִכָּל-מִצְוֹת יְהוָה אֲשֶׁר לֹא תַעֲשִׂינָהּ וְלֹא-יָדַע וְאִשָּׁם וְנִשְׂא עֲוֹנוֹ: (יח) וְהָבִיא אֵיל תָּמִים מִן-הַצֹּאן בְּעֶרְכָּהּ לְאִשָּׁם אֶל-הַכֹּהֵן וְכָפַר עָלָיו הַכֹּהֵן עַל שְׂגִגְתּוֹ אֲשֶׁר-שָׁגָג וְהוּא לֹא-יָדַע וְנִסְלַח לוֹ: (יט) אִשָּׁם הוּא אִשָּׁם אִשָּׁם לַיהוָה: {פ}

Leviticus 5:17-19

(17) And a person who, without knowing it, sins in regard to any of יהוה’s commandments about things not to be done, and then realizes guilt: Such a person shall be subject to punishment. (18) That person shall bring to the priest a ram without blemish from the flock, or the equivalent, as a guilt offering. For the error committed unwittingly, the priest shall make expiation on behalf of that person, who shall be forgiven. (19) It is a guilt offering; guilt has been incurred before יהוה.

(ד) אף על פי שתקיעת שופר בראש השנה גזרת הכתוב רמז יש בו כלומר עורו ישנים משנתכם ונרדמים הקיצו מתרדמתכם וחפשו במעשיכם וחזרו בתשובה וזכרו בוראכם. אלו השוכחים את האמת בהבלי הזמן ושוגים כל שנתם בהבל וריק אשר לא יועיל ולא יציל, הביטו לנפשותיכם והיטיבו דרכיכם ומעלליכם ויעזב כל אחד מכם דרכו הרעה ומחשבתו אשר לא טובה. לפיכך צריך כל אדם שיראה עצמו כל השנה כלה כאלו חציו זכאי וחציו חייב. וכן כל העולם חציו זכאי וחציו חייב. חטא אחד הרי הכריע את עצמו ואת כל העולם כלו לכף חובה וגרם לו השחתה. עשה מצוה אחת הרי הכריע את עצמו ואת כל העולם כלו לכף זכות וגרם לו ולהם תשועה והצלה שנאמר (משלי י-כה) "ויצדיק יסוד עולם" זה שצדק הכריע את כל העולם לזכות והצילו. ומפני ענין זה נהגו כל בית ישראל להרבות בצדקה ובמעשים טובים ולעסק במצות מראש השנה ועד יום הכפורים יתר מכל השנה. ונהגו כלם לקום בלילה בעשרה ימים אלו ולהתפלל בבתי כנסיות בדברי תחנונים ובכבושין עד שיאור היום:

Mishneh Torah, Repentance 3:4

(4) Even though the blowing of the shofar on Rosh HaShanah is a Biblical decree, it hints at something, i.e., "Wake up, sleepers, from your sleep! And slumberers, arise from your slumber! Search your

ways and return in *teshuvah* and remember your Creator! Those who forget the Truth amidst the futility of the moment and are infatuated all their years with vanity and nothingness that will not help and will not save, examine your souls and improve your ways and your motivations! Let each of you abandon his wicked ways, and his thoughts which are no good." Therefore a person needs to see himself all year long as if he is half innocent and half guilty, and also [see] the whole world - half innocent and half guilty. If he sins one sin - he has tilted herself and the whole world to the side of guilt and caused its destruction. If he does one *mitzvah* - he has tilted herself and the whole world to the side of innocence and caused redemption and rescue, as it says, *the righteous are the foundation of the world* (Proverbs 10:25). This refers to a righteousness that has tilted the whole world to innocence and saved it. And for this reason the whole House of Israel has a custom to increase charity and good deeds, and to engage in *mitzvot* from Rosh HaShanah until Yom Kippur, more than the rest of the year. And everyone has the custom to wake up during the night on these ten days and to pray in the synagogue with words of pleading and words of surrender until daylight.

משנה תורה, הלכות תשובה בי"א

(א) ב,א איזו היא תשובה גמורה--זה שבא לידו דבר שעבר בו, ואפשר בידו לעשות, ופרש ולא עשה מפני התשובה, לא מיראה ולא מכשלוון כות. כיצד: הרי שבא על אשה בעברה, ולאחר זמן נתיחד עמה והוא עומד באהבתו בה ובכוח גופו,

וּבְמִדִּינָהּ שְׁעֵבֶר בָּהּ, וּפִרְשׁ וְלֹא עָבֵר--זֶה הוּא בְּעַל תְּשׁוּבָה
גְּמוּרָה. הוּא שְׁשָׁלְמָה אוֹמֵר "וּזְכֹר, אֶת-בוֹרְאֶיךָ, בְּיָמֶי, בְּחֹרְתֶיךָ"
(קוהלת יב,א).

Mishneh Torah, Repentance 2:1

(1) What is complete *teshuvah*? When a person has the opportunity to commit the same sin, and he possess the ability to do it, but he separates and does not do it because of *teshuvah* and not out of fear or lack of strength. What is an example? A person who had illicit sex with a woman, and after some time he is alone with her, and he still loves her and possesses his physical power and is in the same country where he committed the sin, but he separates and does not sin – that person is a complete *ba'al teshuvah*, about whom [King] Solomon said, *Remember your Creator in the days of your youth* (Ecclesiastes 12:1).

משנה תורה, הלכות תשובה א'א'

(א) א,א כָּל הַמְצוּוֹת שֶׁבַתּוֹרָה, בֵּין עֲשֵׂה בֵּין לֹא תַעֲשֶׂה--אִם
עָבֵר אָדָם עַל אַחַת מֵהֶן, בֵּין בְּזִדּוֹן בֵּין בְּשִׁגְגָה--כְּשִׁי־עֲשֵׂה
תְּשׁוּבָה וַיָּשׁוּב מִחֲטָאוֹ, חִיָּב לְהִתְוֹדוֹת לְפָנֵי הָאֵל בְּרוּךְ הוּא:
שְׁנַאֲמַר "אִישׁ אוֹ-אִשָּׁה כִּי יַעֲשׂוּ מְכַל-חַטָּאת הָאָדָם . . .
וְהִתְוֹדוּ, אֶת-חַטָּאתָם אֲשֶׁר עָשׂוּ" (במדבר ה,ו-ז), זֶה וְדוּי
דְּבָרִים. וְדוּי זֶה מְצוֹת עֲשֵׂה.

Mishneh Torah, Repentance 1:1

(1) All of the commandments in the Torah: whether they be the positive commandments, or the negative commandments; if a person transgressed any of them, whether he did so intentionally, whether he did so unintentionally, when he repents and returns from sinning - he is obligated to confess before God, as it says, (Numbers 5:6-7) "When a man or a women does any of the sins of man...and he shall confess his sin that he committed..." - this refers to a verbal confession. And confession, that is a positive commandment.

משנה תורה, הלכות תשובה א'ב'

(ב) א, ב כיצד מתודה--אומר אנא יי חטאתי עויתי פשעתי
לפניך, ועשיתי כף ופך, והרי נחמתי ובשתי במעשי, ולעולם
איני חוזר לדבר זה. זה הוא עיקרו שלודוי; וכל המרבה
להתודות ולהאריך בענין זה, הרי זה משבח.

Mishneh Torah, Repentance 1:2

(2) How does he confess? He says, "Please God, I have sinned, I have erred, I have [willfully but unrebliously] transgressed, I have done such-and-such [specific sins], I am regretful, and ashamed for my actions, and I will never again return to my old ways." This is the essence of the confession, and anyone who wants to lengthen [his confession], this is praiseworthy.

משנה תורה, הלכות תשובה ב'א'

(ו) ב,ו [ה] וּשְׁבַח גָּדוֹל לְשֵׁב שְׂיִתְוֹדָה בְּרַבִּים וְיִוְדִיעַ פְּשָׁעָיו לָהֶם, וּמִגְלָה עֲבֵרוֹת שְׂפִינוּ לְבֵין חֲבֵרוֹ לְאַחֵרִים, וְאוֹמֵר לָהֶם אֲמַנֶּם חָטָאתִי לְפָלוֹנִי וְעָשִׂיתִי לוֹ כָּךְ וְכָךְ, וְהֵרִינִי הַיּוֹם שָׁב וְנָחֵם. וְכָל הַמִּתְגַּאֶה וְאִינוֹ מוֹדִיעַ, אֵלֶּא מְכַסֶּה פְּשָׁעָיו--אֵין תְּשׁוּבָתוֹ גְּמוּרָה, שְׁנֵאמַר "מְכַסֶּה פְּשָׁעָיו, לֹא יִצְלִיחַ" (משלי כח, יג).

Mishneh Torah, Repentance 2:6

(6) It is very praiseworthy for the penitent to confess in public and disclose his sins to them, and reveal interpersonal sins to others and tell them: "I surely sinned against so-and-so and did such-and-such to him; but today, behold, I return and regret." But anyone who is prideful and does not disclose, but rather hides his sins – his *teshuvah* is not complete, as it says, *One who covers his transgressions shall not prosper* (Proverbs 28:13).

פרק ב:ד

מדרכי התשובה, להיות השב צועק תמיד לפני השם בככי ובתחנונים, ועושה צדקה כפי כחו. ומתרחק הרבה מן הדבר שחטא בו, ומשנה שמו, כלומר: אני אחר, ואיני אותו האיש שעשה אותן המעשים. ומשנה מעשיו כלן לטובה ולדרך ישרה, וגולה ממקומו; שגלות מכפרת עון. מפני שגורמת לו להכנע ולהיות עני ושפל-רוח.

Among the paths of repentance is for the penitent to

- a) constantly call out before God, crying and entreating;
- b) to perform charity according to one's potential;
- c) to separate oneself far from the object of one's sin;
- d) to change one's, as if to say, "I am a different person and not the same who sinned";
- e) to change one's behavior in its entirety to the good and the path of righteousness; and
- f) to travel in exile from one's home. Exile atones for sin because it causes a person to be submissive, humble, and meek of spirit.

Melanie Klein, Love, Guilt and Reparation p311-2

Klein LGR p311

I said before that feelings of love and gratitude arise directly and spontaneously in the baby in response to the love and care of his mother. The power of love—which is the manifestation of the forces which tend to preserve life—is there in the baby as well as the destructive impulses, and finds its first fundamental expression in the baby's attachment to his mother's breast, which develops into love for her as a person.

My psycho-analytic work has convinced me that when in the baby's mind the conflicts between love and hate arise, and the fears of losing

the loved one become active, a very important step is made in development. These feelings of guilt and distress now enter as a new element into the emotion of love. They become an inherent part of love, and influence it profoundly both in quality and quantity.

Even in the small child one can observe a concern for the loved one which is not, as one might think, merely a sign of dependence upon a friendly and helpful person.

Side by side with the destructive impulses in the unconscious mind both of the child and of the adult, there exists a profound urge to make sacrifices, in order to help and to put right loved people who in phantasy have been harmed or destroyed.

In the depths of the mind, the urge to make people happy is linked up with a strong feeling of responsibility and concern for them, which manifests itself in genuine sympathy with other people and in the ability to understand them, as they are and as they feel.

Our grievances against our parents for having frustrated us, together with the feelings of hate and revenge to which these have given rise in us, and again, the feelings of guilt and despair arising out of this hate and revenge because we have injured the parents whom at the same time we loved—all these, in phantasy, we may undo in retrospect (taking away some of the grounds for hatred), by playing at the same time the parts of loving parents and loving children.

At the same time, in our unconscious phantasy we make good the injuries which we did in phantasy, and for which we still unconsciously

feel very guilty. This making reparation is, in my view, a fundamental element in love and in all human relationships; I shall therefore refer to it frequently in what follows.
